



**THE BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN  
GALE BREWER, BOROUGH PRESIDENT  
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FIVE**

**VIKKI BARBERO, CHAIR MARISA MAACK, DISTRICT MANAGER**

Minutes of the regular Community Board Five meeting held on **Thursday, November 12, 2020 via teleconferencing, at 6:00pm. Vikki Barbero, Chair, presided.**

**Members Present**

David Achelis  
Nicholas Athanail  
Zach Bahor  
Vikki Barbero  
James Beitchman  
Mary Brosnahan  
Kelly Burton  
Renee Cafaro  
Julie Chou  
Christopher Clark  
James Dale  
Sarah Dowson  
Aaron Ford  
Joseph Frewer  
Laura Garcia  
Jordan Goldman  
Nancy Goshow  
Tristan Haas  
John B. Harris, Jr.  
William Heyer  
Robert Isaacs  
Samuel Johnson  
Michael Kaback  
E.J. Kalafarski

Renee Kinsella  
Layla Law-Gisiko  
Sam Levy  
Blaga Lucic  
Joseph Maffia  
Kimberly McCall  
Evan Meyerson  
Charles Miller  
Janet Pawson  
Jonathan Rabar  
Tod Shapiro  
Craig Slutzkin  
Clayton Smith  
Barbara Spandorf  
Noah Stern  
Sarah BJ Sung  
Simon Tschinkel  
Jessica Verdi  
Pete Webb  
Rachel Weintraub  
Ryan Whalen  
July Yang

**Present Part**

Jamie Kang  
Daniel Spence

Laurie Harjowaroga  
Speaker Johnson

Taylor Abbruzzese  
Congresswoman  
Maloney

**Absent**

Matthew Hartman

Justin Flagg  
Senator Krueger

**Excused**

**Public Members**

Miriam Berman  
Suzanne Johnson

B Peyre  
Assembly Member  
Gottfried

**Elected Officials**

Kate Theobald  
Councilmember Powers

Brad Hoylman  
Senator

Jeremy Unger  
Councilmember Rivera

**Staff**

Marisa Maack  
District Manager

Luke Szabados  
Community Associate

**Public Attendees**

Lisa Wager  
Lary Aronson

**At 6:00 p.m., the Manhattan Community Board Five November 12, 2020 full Board meeting was called to**

**PUBLIC SESSION**

**Jeremy Unger - Council Member Carlina Rivera's Office:** spoke of crazy few weeks in New York City and around the country and the Council's focus on the rise of COVID-19 cases. He spoke of the hearing held on lessons learned in the treatment of COVID-19 and how hospitals are going to handle

patients' loads. He announced that Councilwoman Rivera has introduced legislation to remove the term "Mental Retardation" from the city's laws and charts and replacing it with "Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities". He spoke of situation at the Mave Hotel and the concerns of the closure in terms of how quickly it was done with families who have kids who are in local schools. He stated that they will continue to work with the Department of Homeless Services (DHS), CB5 and everyone else on the larger issue of transfers during the pandemic and stated that there should be a moratorium on hotel shelter transfers right now. He also spoke of the situation with a drummer in the Flatiron Plaza causing quite a lot of noise and attempts to get relevant agencies such as the NYPD and Parks Department to get the situation handled.

**Kate Theobald - Council Member Keith Powers' Office:** announced that since the November election, Councilmember Powers office was engaged in assisting the Borough President's office with troubleshooting questions about absentee ballots and poll sites. She thanked CB5 Budget, Education and City Services Committee for inviting her and other elected officials to speak about the election law matters and for the opportunity to talk about Councilmember Powers' bill to support installing absentee ballot drop off boxes in New York City. She then spoke of the focus on monitoring and managing the recent uptick in COVID-19 cases. She stated that Councilmember Powers has also been looking at what is needed to make sure Midtown is ready for economic recovery when that time comes. She spoke of the Op-ed published last week that focused on things such as safe and reliable transportation and how that will be a key component This would include more spaces for Citi Bikes, increased accessibility at our subway stops and more shared streets such as the proposed one next to Grand Central. She also announced legislation to remove the issuance and administration of press credentials from the NYPD to an independent agency to allow more transparency and accountability in this region.

**Justin Flagg, State Senator Liz Krueger:** announced that on COVID-19, Senator Krueger's message is that, we have to not only remain vigilant, we need to ramp our vigilance back up to levels that we had in the first wave. He spoke of the Governor's issuance new restrictions that will go into effect tomorrow night: bars and restaurants have to close by 10pm, except for takeout. Gyms and fitness centers also have to close by 10pm, and no more than 10 people are allowed in private gatherings. He stated that Senator Krueger is thankful that her constituents have sent her back to Albany for another term and that there were big problems with the Board of Elections administration of the election and that Senator Krueger will be holding a round table in December on a bill to professionalize the Board of Elections in the city and details will be announced.

**Laurie Harjowaroga, Speaker Johnson:** She thanked CB5 for working with the Speaker's office on issues regarding 23rd, 24th and 25th Street and Sixth Avenue including issues from illegal vending to an increase in homeless individuals and drug use. She spoke of holding a meeting with approximately 30 people, joined by Marisa and Luke to follow up on a September meeting with many of the stakeholders in the area. She stated that they are seeing a lot of progress with property owners adding lighting and some of the empty lots have been secured. Also, Flatiron BID has cleaned up a lot of the graffiti and has been doing a lot of work around the vending issue. She announced that their office held a donation drive to assist people living in shelters, and they are grateful for the outpouring of support from the community. They have received hundreds of donations of everyday commodities such as shampoos, toothpaste, which are invaluable during such a challenging time. She stated that the office will also continue to deliver meals in District 3 during the month of October. She also announced the third annual toy drive coming up and asked people to consider donating new unwrapped toys suitable for children from three months to 17 years old.

**Luke Wolf, Comptroller Scott Stringer's Office:** spoke of work being done by the Comptroller's office this fall; one is making sure students have internet access. He stated that the Comptroller sent a

letter to the Mayor and Chancellor urging the city to act immediately to close the digital divide and proposed that the city offers subsidized and redeemable internet passports for low income families to purchase broadband service from providers in their area to help to ensure that students without internet do not fall further behind in their coursework. The Comptroller also authored a op-ed with Advocates for Children, focused on supporting the 3,000 students living in family shelters in our city. He also spoke of restarting New York City's lagging capital program. He noted that every billion dollars of construction results in approximately 5,000 direct jobs and many multiple thousands of indirect jobs. He stated that infrastructure needs are very significant so going forward we should continue spending on capital budget to make sure we are making investments for our future. Lastly, he stated that the Comptroller launch the survey with an organization called "The Better Balance" to measure how families are balancing work and life during the pandemic.

**Taylor Abbruzzese, Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney's Office:** announced that the Congresswoman is heading back to DC next week with a very heavy workload. He stated that the Congresswoman is trying to get the administration to agree to pay back millions of dollars that it took from the FDNY 911 treatment program. He also spoke of the census and how New York City did pretty well given the circumstances. He also stated that the Congresswoman has continued her fight to protect the USPS, getting additional documents and information regarding the slow downs and changes. He stated that she also introduced a bill to save the Civil Service Act to block the President's recent executive order to reclassify elements of the civil service to make it easier to hire and fire federal employees. He also spoke on Congresswoman Maloney subpoena of Customs Border Patrol over lack of investigation into lewd and threatening social media posts by its agents. She also requested report on the Latino representation in Hollywood which was accepted by the GAO. She also called on the USGS director James Riley to be removed after an inspector general investigation determine that he retaliated against a whistleblower. She is also seeking information on the administration's efforts to withhold federal funds from cities deemed anarchists or additions jurisdictions. He stated that in light of the transition issues, the congresswoman joined other House committee chairs in sending dozens of letters directing White House and federal agencies to preserve documents in accordance with the law.

**B Peyre, Assembly Member Richard Gottfried's Office:** announced co-hosting of free flu shots next Tuesday from 10am to 3pm at the corner of Penn South, corner of 26th Street and Eighth Avenue.

**Brad Hoylman, State Senator:** announced that the Governor signed a bill of his into law which would protect New Yorkers from strategic lawsuits against public participation that are basically being brought by wealthy folks. He noted these include mostly developers who have been trying to silence speech by introducing lawsuits often in the area of defamation. The new bill is going to make it harder for those lawsuits to move forward. He discussed a second bill that has been signed that will protect consumers against automatic renewals of gym memberships. He noted the introduction of a bill called "A Pandemic Self Storage Pack", which will prevent those lien sales from going forward and protect a lot of personal possessions of New Yorkers trying to get back up on their feet and get employed.

**Lisa Wager, Fashion Institute of Technology:** spoke about a problem with the proposed Citi Bike station proposed for Eighth Avenue at 27th Street directly in front of one of the college's loading docks. She spoke of the approval for a new building on 28<sup>th</sup> Street which will be in the college's footprint and where the main loading dock and sanitation pickup area is. She stated that installing a Citi Bike station here will create a significant hardship for the college and the businesses that delivered to and support all of the facilities on campus and it will create unsafe conditions for the bikers who would be using it.

**Larry Aronson – Resident:** stated that going through the neighborhood – in particular, 20th Street between 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenues - there were a lot of in street operations under the open restaurant programs that are starting to enclose their spaces. He was concerned that such spaces without proper ventilation

and closed with heaters in it are actually more dangerous than being inside. He thanked the community board and questioned if the community board was involved, who was collecting data on the program and when can some information be made available to the public on its success or its problems.

## **BUSINESS SESSION**

- **VOTE ON THE OCTOBER 2020 MINUTES**

The October 2020 minutes passed with a vote of 45 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstaining, as follows: **IN FAVOR:** Achelis, Athanail, Bahor, Beitchman, Brosnahan, Burton, Cafaro, Chou, Clark, Dale, Dowson, Ford, Frewer, Garcia, Goldman, Goshow, Haas, Harris Jr., Heyer, Isaacs, Johnson, Kaback, Kalafarski, Kinsella, Law-Gisiko, Levy, Lucic, Maffia, McCall, Meyerson, Miller, Pawson, Rabar, Shapiro, Slutzkin, Smith, Spandorf, Stern, Sung, Tschinkel, Verdi, Webb, Weintraub, Whalen, Yang. **ABSTAIN:** Barbero.

- **CHAIR'S REPORT – VIKKI BARBERO**

No Chair's Report.

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **LANDMARKS – LAYLA LAW-GISIKO**

**Ms. Law-Gisiko gave a brief presentation on the following resolution:**

*1619 Broadway - TD Bank requests approval for an internally illuminated bracket sign that exceeds maximum size and extension requirements*

WHEREAS, 1619 Broadway ("Brill Building") is an eleven-story brick and terra cotta Art Deco building constructed in 1930-31 by Abraham Lefcourt, one of New York's most prolific developers in the 1920's and thereafter sold to the Brill brothers; and

WHEREAS, The creative culture of the music companies in the Brill Building came to define the influential "Brill Building Sound" and the style of popular music songwriting and recording that was created by its writers and producers; and

WHEREAS, 1619 Broadway was designated a landmark by the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) in 2010 due to the highly decorated Art Deco style of the Brill Building, the influential and popular music associated with the Brill Building and Abraham Lefcourt being the developer of the Brill Building; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant has applied to install a new illuminated bracket sign on the Brill Building; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant has proposed that the signage on the Brill Building replace the designated "Sign H" in the Master Plan; and

WHEREAS, The new bracket sign has a smaller footprint thereby enabling additional parts of the Brill Building to be visible; and

WHEREAS, The historic Brill Building entry façade on Broadway will remain intact; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant's proposal is contextual with the Brill Building's location at the corner of Broadway and 49th Street; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant's proposal is an appropriate improvement for the Brill Building's Master Plan, and is harmonious with the Times Square neighborhood; and

WHEREAS, The Committee requests that the Master Plan be updated to replace Sign H with the new proposed bracket sign so that the number of permitted signs is not increased; and

WHEREAS, The Committee remains concerned that the new sign may puncture the terra cotta façade on the Landmark, leaving puncture wounds; and

WHEREAS, The Committee is concerned that the new branded "door pull" is not contextual; therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, Community Board Five **recommends denial unless**

- **the official Master Plan is altered by LPC to replace Sign H with the new illuminated Bracket Sign, so as to retain the same number of permitted signage; and**
- **the illuminated Bracket Sign is installed employing the least intrusive method possible to avoid puncture wounds and penetration points in the Building, especially in the terra cotta tiles, favoring joint penetration rather than terra cotta penetration; and**
- **the existing door handles / door pulls are stored for future use by a future tenant at a future date.**

After some discussion the above resolution passed with a vote of 45 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstaining: **IN FAVOR:** Achelis, Athanail, Bahor, Beitchman, Brosnahan, Burton, Cafaro, Chou, Clark, Dale, Dowson, Ford, Frewer, Garcia, Goldman, Goshow, Haas, Harris Jr., Heyer, Isaacs, Johnson, Kaback, Kalafarski, Kinsella, Law-Gisiko, Levy, Lucic, Maffia, McCall, Meyerson, Miller, Pawson, Rabar, Shapiro, Slutzkin, Smith, Spandorf, Stern, Sung, Tschinkel, Verdi, Webb, Weintraub, Whalen, Yang. **ABSTAIN:** Barbero.

## **LAND USE, HOUSING AND ZONING – LAYLA LAW-GISIKO**

**Ms. Law-Gisiko gave brief presentations on the following two resolution:**

***58--60 West 39th Street, application to the Board of Standards and Appeals by H Hotel LLC renew building permits lawfully issued before December 20, 2018***

WHEREAS, H Hotel LLC, the owner of the Subject Property at 58-60 West 39th Street (the "Applicant") is requesting the Board of Standards and Appeals (the "BSA") to renew building permits (the "Existing Permit"), pursuant to the common law of the State of New York, and pursuant to Zoning Resolution ("ZR") Section 11-331, for a 31-story hotel (the "Hotel") at 58-60 West 39th Street in a M1-6 zoning district; and

WHEREAS, The Subject Property is located in an M1-6 zoning district, except for a three-foot-wide area along its western lot line (i.e., the portion of the Subject Property located within 150 feet of Sixth Avenue), which is located in a C5-3 zoning district and also in the Special Midtown District (“MiD”); and

WHEREAS, The Existing Permits were issued prior to a December 20, 2018 amendment to the Zoning Resolution, which provided that a hotel in a M-1 zoning district would no longer be permitted as-of-right, but only if a special permit is approved by the City Planning Commission and the City Council, and, accordingly, the Existing Permits expired; and

WHEREAS, A permit for excavation and foundation work was issued by the Department of Buildings (the “DOB”) in July, 2018; and

WHEREAS, A New Building permit (the “NB Permit”) was issued by the DOB for the Development on November 30, 2018 for a transient hotel with 40,977 square feet of zoning floor area, 86 rooms and a restaurant and beverage venues; and

WHEREAS, The Developer intends to construct a larger version of the Development by acquiring 19,189.25 square feet of excess floor area from the parcel located to the west of the Subject Property, at 64 West 39th Street (Block 840, Lot 6) (the “Adjacent Parcel”); The Adjacent Parcel is located in a C5-3 (MiD) zoning district and the larger Development is envisioned as a 34-story transient hotel with approximately 173 rooms and approximately 62,062.5 square feet of zoning floor area that will cantilever over the Adjacent Parcel by approximately 25 feet; and

WHEREAS, Pursuant to Section 11-331 of the ZR and pursuant to the common law of the State of New York, Applicant is requesting the BSA approve a renewal of the Existing Permits; and

WHEREAS, According to Section 11-331 of the ZR, if, before the effective date of an applicable amendment of this Resolution, a building permit has been lawfully issued, to a person with a possessory interest in a *zoning lot*, authorizing a major development, such construction, if lawful in other respects, may be continued provided that the foundations for at least one *building* had been completed prior to such effective date; and

WHEREAS, According to Section 11-331 of the ZR, in the event that such required foundations have been commenced but not completed before such effective date, the building permit shall automatically lapse on the effective date and the right to continue construction shall terminate; and

WHEREAS, According to Section 11-331 of the ZR, an application to renew the building permit may be made to the Board of Standards and Appeals not more than 30 days after the lapse of such building permit and the BSA may renew the building permit and authorize an extension of time limited to one term of not more than six months to permit the completion of the required foundations, provided that the Board finds that, on the date the building permit lapsed, excavation had been completed and substantial progress made on foundations; and

WHEREAS, The BSA application was filed by the applicant on July 24, 2020, 582 days (1 year, 7 months and 4 days) after the amendment became effective, well past the permitted 30 day application window; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant stated that demolition and excavation were complete as of December 20, 2018 and 70% of foundations were complete, provided affidavits from engineer and concrete logs but provided no physical evidence of such statement (photographs, etc.); and

WHEREAS, The Applicant stated that as of the amendment adoption, they had spent \$11.7 million or approximately 16% of the \$70,113,670.66 total cost of the Development, broken down to \$6.6 million on hard cost (demolition and excavation necessary of any use, including conforming uses) and \$5.1 million on soft cost; and

WHEREAS, Demolition and excavation associated costs can serve both a hotel use and a conforming use and therefore are not rendered useless by the new amendment; and

WHEREAS, The foundations are generic enough that they can serve the initial 31 story hotel development as well as the more complex 34 story, multi-cantilevered project the developer ultimately intends to build, suggesting that the foundations can easily be adapted to serve a conforming use, and therefore are not rendered useless by the new amendment; and

WHEREAS, The Applicant commissioned an appraisal report for a multi-tenant commercial office development (conforming use), that states:

#### AS VACANT

The property is zoned for various commercial uses and is of sufficient size to accommodate various types of development. The immediate area includes various commercial land uses. Considering the surrounding land uses, location attributes, legal restrictions and other factors, it is our opinion that a commercial oriented use (i.e. hotel, office and/or retail) would be reasonable and appropriate. Therefore, it is our opinion that the highest and best use would be for commercial-related use, time and circumstances warranting.

#### AS IMPROVED

We assume the hypothetical office development is the subject's highest and best use as-improved for the purpose of this appraisal and in accordance with the Scope of Work"; and

WHEREAS, The hotel development would have an As-Complete Value of \$43,600,000 and an office development alternative would have an As-Complete Value of \$21,800,000, and while the hotel valuation is higher, an office alternative has a significant value; and

WHEREAS, In order to gain the vested right, the landowner's actions relying on a valid permit must be so substantial that the municipal action results in serious loss rendering the improvements essentially valueless, *Cine SK8, Inc. v. Town of Henrietta*, 507 F.3d 778, 784 (2d Cir. 2007) (internal quotation marks omitted); and

WHEREAS, The applicant did not establish that the hotel-specific spending associated with the development was substantial enough to result in serious loss; and

WHEREAS, The amendment to the ZR promulgated on December 20, 2018, states that Hotels in M1 Districts may directly or indirectly detract from opportunities for other kinds of development, by occupying vacant or underdeveloped sites that could have been available to other uses better equipped to fulfill neighborhood development objectives and needs, or by accelerating neighborhood change with the expansion of tourism-oriented uses; and

WHEREAS, There are already four large hotels on this block, at 245 W 38 St., 63 W 38 St., 69 W 39 St., and 26 W 39 St. (aka 19 W 38 St), and the last also applied for a BSA permit (196-58-BZ; Cal 2019-175-A) to complete the construction of a 299 room hotel after the amendment entered in effect; and

WHEREAS, The design, height, bulk, massing of the Hotel is not harmonious with neighboring architecture, would disrupt the streetscape; and

WHEREAS, The proposed plans show a large number of mechanical floors, with excessively high floor to floor heights, suggesting that the development is using a practice known as "mechanical void" to artificially increase the height of the building while not using additional FAR, a practice that has been banned in other parts of Manhattan; and

WHEREAS, Hotel use in M1 districts conflicts with CB5 district priorities as it competes with class B and class C office space; and

WHEREAS, The applicant has not demonstrated severe financial hardship or a vested interest in a hotel development and the appraisal commissioned by the applicant and produced by CBRE concludes that a conforming use (commercial) would be a high-performing use; and

WHEREAS, The transient hotel market has been gravely impacted by CoVID-19 pandemic and may not be a sustainable use, especially in an area that is already a oversaturated with hotels; and

WHEREAS, The Zoning Text Amendment passed by the City Planning Commission and the City Council in 2018 aims to address this exact type of hotel development that aims only to maximize profit with no regards for the urban environment, the streetscape context, or the needs of the district; and

WHEREAS, The applicant purchased the land in 2016, but filed permits only in summer 2018, shortly after the Department of City Planning had filed their proposal to amend the zoning resolution to no longer permit as-of-right hotels in M1 districts, to “beat the clock”, and applicant was likely aware that a hotel use may no longer be as-of-right; and

WHEREAS, Hotel use is permitted by special permit and the applicant can file a special permit with the Department of City Planning, as provided under the new zoning; and

WHEREAS, The applicant filed the present BSA application on July 14, 2020, 582 days after the amendment entered into effect and while being filed pursuant to common law, it is against the spirit of ZR section 11-331 that allows 30 days to file recourse with BSA;

WHEREAS, The applicant does not have a vested interest because they did not spend a substantial amount on a hotel specific development, a conforming use would be a high-value development and a special permit can be issued for hotel use; Therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, Community Board Five **recommends denial** of 58-60 West 39th LLC’s request to the BSA for a Renewed Permit, for the hotel located at 58-60 West 39th Street.

*Statement of principle on design and reconstruction of the Park Avenue Malls*

WHEREAS, The Park Avenue Malls were created in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century when the train tracks running north from Grand Central Terminal were covered; and

WHEREAS, The malls were designed as public open space with benches and plantings; and

WHEREAS, In 1927, Park Avenue was enlarged for vehicular traffic and the malls were narrowed; and

WHEREAS, The Park Avenue Malls are under DOT jurisdiction, but are maintained by non-for-profit organizations, building owners and BIDs; and

WHEREAS, The train shed located partly underneath the Park Avenue Malls is in a state of grave disrepair and will have to be systematically repaired by entirely removing the malls from 46<sup>th</sup> street to 57<sup>th</sup> street; and

WHEREAS, The necessary repairs identified by the MTA provide a lifetime opportunity to redesign the Park Avenue Malls to create a superior publicly accessible open space; and

WHEREAS, During the Greater East Midtown rezoning, Community Board Five along with numerous other stakeholders, advocated for funds generated by new developments and administered by the Governing Group to be allocated to the Park Avenue Malls; and

WHEREAS, DOT and the Mayor’s Office – in consultation with MTA – are currently working on a design for the mall replacement at Sector 1 between East 47th and East 48th Streets, in conjunction with the JP Morgan Chase new headquarters development, that could include widening the malls; and

WHEREAS, The necessary train shed repairs coupled to new developments in East Midtown provide a unique opportunity to redesign the Park Avenue Malls to create a world class publicly accessible open space that would tremendously enhance East Midtown public realm; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five is committed to being a part of the Park Avenue Malls redesign, and the potential for opening them to increased use by the public; therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, That Community Board Five **urges** relevant agencies and authorities to seek the expertise of urban design and landscape experts to create a superior open space at the Park Avenue Malls that will be embraced by generations to come.

After much discussion on the use of the mall, the above two resolutions passed with a vote of 46 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstaining: **IN FAVOR:** Achelis, Athanail, Bahor, Beitchman, Brosnahan, Burton, Cafaro, Chou, Clark, Dale, Dowson, Ford, Frewer, Garcia, Goldman, Goshow, Haas, Harris Jr., Heyer, Isaacs, Johnson, Kaback, Kalafarski, Kinsella, Law-Gisiko, Levy, Lucic, Maffia, McCall, Meyerson, Miller, Pawson, Rabar, Shapiro, Slutzkin, Smith, Spandorf, Spence, Stern, Sung, Tschinkel, Verdi, Webb, Weintraub, Whalen, Yang. **ABSTAIN:** Barbero.

## **BUDGET, EDUCATION AND CITY SERVICES – RENEE KINSELLA**

### **Ms. Kinsella gave the following report on voting and elections.**

Ms. Kinsella thanked committee member Rachel Weintraub for organizing following the Board of Elections and voting as an issue for the committee. She stated that at the meeting, they heard from Justin Flagg from Senator Krueger's office, Councilmember Powers' office and Laurie Harjowaroga from Speaker Johnson's office. She stated that they briefed the committee on bills that have recently passed and effect elections and early voting, which we saw this year the consolidation of federal and state primaries, which is going to save us time and money. Also the transfer of voter registration, which is streamline now for people who move within the state of New York and pre-registration for 16 and 17 year olds. She also spoke of two bills that were passed last year that are constitutional amendments, so they need to pass them to success of lesser legislatures and then be voted on by referendum and those two issues are the same day voter registrations, meaning you can register and vote on the same day. And number two is no excuse absentee voting. She stated they learned that more poll sites are needed and the State Senate is considering a bill that prohibits the use of schools for early voting, but also mandates that building that receives tax exemptions and owned by an entity that gets more than a million dollars in state grant funding can be required to be used as an early voting site, unless the owner can demonstrate hardship.

### **Ms. Kinsella then gave a brief presentation on the following report:**

#### ***FY22 District Needs and Budget Priorities***

#### **District Overview**

Manhattan Community Board Five (CB5) beats with the pulse of the City in the heart of Manhattan. Our boundaries extend from Lexington to 8th Avenues and 14th to 59th Streets, but the scope of life in our

District is a microcosm of New York City (the “City”). All of the ethnic, cultural, economic and social diversity and disparity found across our city is displayed vividly in CB5. We are the City’s midtown central business District as well as the first and last impression of New York City for millions of commuters and tourists who pass through Penn Station and Grand Central Terminal, or who visit Times Square, Herald Square, Union Square, and Greeley Square every day.

Our District connects every borough to each other and to the world. All but three subway lines traverse CB5, and with the Port Authority just outside our western border the District is at the core of the City’s substantial pedestrian and vehicular traffic. We are the destination for millions of tourists who come here to experience New York City’s greatest business, tourist, entertainment and industrial landmarks, all located in CB5. The Broadway Theater District, the Museum of Modern Art, Radio City Music Hall, Carnegie Hall, Rockefeller Center, and the Flatiron Building are all here, along with world class shopping destinations such as Macy’s, Saks, Tiffany’s, Cartier and Nordstrom (to name but a few).

In the recent past, our District experienced a boom in hotel construction, particularly in the Flower District and the Broadway corridor. Before the downturn caused by the recent pandemic, new bars and restaurants regularly opened throughout the District to service the increasing number of visitors, generating substantial sales tax and other revenues for the City. Office and residential density expanded given the proximity to the transportation hubs in our District resulting in an appreciation of public and pedestrian spaces by residents and workers alike. Three of the City’s most intensely utilized parks -- Bryant, Madison Square, and Union Square -- are located within the District, as well as Herald and Greeley Squares. Our residents and visitors cherish pedestrian friendly amenities such as pedestrian paths of travel, shared urban pathways, and expanded bicycle lanes. The extraordinary growth and popularity of CB5, combined with our proximity to transportation hubs, commercial centers, and tourist attractions, create unique and substantial budgetary needs and corresponding opportunities.

## **District Needs**

The pandemic year of 2020 has brought fundamental challenges to the district. Homelessness, sanitation, congestion and noise have always been an issue, but these conditions have worsened substantially, bringing with them concerns about public safety. For FY2022, the three most pressing issues facing CB5 are homelessness, quality of life issues (noise, graffiti, petty crime, street conditions), and economic development and recovery. We see these conditions as closely related because they threaten both the reality and perception of the City’s resiliency, commitment to justice and fairness, and ultimate survival.

**Homelessness:** The pandemic and the City’s decision to utilize hotels in the District to house homeless individuals has highlighted the stunning deficiencies in the City’s network of social services for those experiencing homelessness or threatened with it. The homeless, and indeed all New Yorkers, deserve better. Fundamentally, our city needs more affordable housing – in our District and elsewhere. However, we also need high-quality temporary shelters and housing programs now to serve the homeless. That includes comprehensive programming with wrap-around services such as mental health and substance abuse treatment as well as facility improvements to provide for that and enrichment programming on site. CB5 encourages the City and shelter providers to craft solutions that meet the homeless where they are and to address their concerns regarding safety, possessions, pets, significant others and recreation and social space as a means of creating a more comfortable, welcoming and productive environment for those experiencing homelessness.

**Quality of Life Issues:** The pandemic has moved Quality of Life issues front and center in our district. The symptoms are as clear as the causes are myriad. Street and sidewalk noise, increasing graffiti, unauthorized street vendors, petty crime, panhandling, loitering and street encampments all detract from

the quality of life in the District and feed the perception that the City is not safe. While CB5 believes addressing the underlying issues of education, economic opportunity and homelessness will strike at the roots of these societal issues, consistent enforcement of existing regulations will also help. The goal of enforcement being not to criminalize any social condition but to create an environment where the rights of all are respected and the public space remains dedicated to the public. Visitors and residents alike should expect that existing regulations --for example, prohibiting cars and delivery trucks from double parking or “blocking the box”, prohibiting cyclists from riding on the sidewalk or in the opposite direction of traffic, discouraging pedestrians who walk in the bike lane, cracking down on illegal food carts and un-permitted street vendors – will be enforced to help protect the quality of life of all residents and workers in the district. CB5 also continues to seek the removal of old phone booths, street encampments, and Link kiosks where they are redundant, unnecessary or an attractive nuisance. In addition, CB5 believes our air and light are public assets that should not be privatized or monopolized by private developers. Light and air must be approached as any other budget assets and they must be treated and protected as such.

**Economic Development and Recovery** CB5 is a district heavily dependent upon commuters, business and tourists, which have been virtually non-existent during the pandemic. As the City begins to reopen, it is estimated that about one-third of small businesses may not survive and that over 520,000 jobs will be lost, many of them located in CB5. Businesses in the District will require commercial tenant programs, better business programs as well grants and loans in order to recover from the economic devastation wrought by the pandemic. CB5 encourages public / private collaboration to address the challenges faced by businesses small and large. In particular, CB5 recognizes the important economic role that Broadway Theatre plays in the District and in New York City overall. Theatrical Art organizations require grants, loans and increased marketing supports as well as support for the safety of all theatergoers, residents and tourists.

**Sanitation:** Overflowing garbage cans and debris on the streets around them has always been an issue in CB5. However, it has become much worse after the City’s disastrous cut in services (now partially restored) in early 2020. Large institutions, BIDs, resident associations and individual citizens have all called for additional sanitation services to ensure the removal of street litter and the timely collection of full litter bins. The increasing number of homeless individuals has also triggered the need for corresponding additional public sanitation services including a significant increase in the frequency of corner trash pick-up. Our District needs many additional litter baskets, recycling and composting bins. This responsibility is uniquely a City responsibility. It cannot be delegated or ignored and, when paired with our other priorities this year – quality of life and actions to address homelessness on our streets – offers a dramatic opportunity for visible and lasting improvement in the district. Electronic waste and composting services have also been reduced or eliminated during budget cuts and desperately need to be restored.

**Healthcare and Human Services:** The most pressing healthcare and human service issue within the District is the provision of services to reduce or prevent homelessness. CB5 has seen a great increase in the number of homeless people throughout the district. Access to health care and mental health, substance abuse treatment and prevention programs are important to assist in alleviating the plight of those on the streets. CB5 has, for many years, directed many of its budget requests to these issues and has done so again this year as we request new affordable housing, supportive housing, as well as mental health and addiction recovery beds and services.

**Youth Education and Child Welfare:** Access to remote learning and technology, specifically access to wifi, computers and ipads are the most important elements of Youth, Education and Child Welfare within the CB5. District schools have requested additional resources in this area as students study remotely and

it is vitally important that they have the tools to participate and communicate with their teachers and other students.

Additionally, CB5 believes that schools within and just outside the District are underfunded in respect to after school programming, internet connectivity, ADA accessibility and mental health care for students, all things that stakeholders within the District have found to be of critical importance.

**Public Safety and Emergency Services:** Enforcement of violations is the number one public safety issue within CB5. Stakeholders have repeatedly noted that enforcement of violations are critically important and that increased and timely enforcement of existing rules and legislation would help to address myriad stakeholder concerns. CB5 supports the transition of some routine public safety enforcement roles -- such as traffic and parking enforcement priorities -- from the NYPD control and placed within other Agencies such as DOT.

**Core Infrastructure and City Services:** Water runoff and trash collection in the 29th Street bike lane has been identified as requiring attention, while trash collection, and particularly in the West 50's and West 20's is also of concern. In addition, CB5 requests the restoration of composting and electronic recycling along with additional sanitation baskets.

**Land Use, Housing and Economic Development:** Affordable housing is one of the single most important issues identified by stakeholders within the District. Not only low and moderate-income families, but increasingly also the middle class is in dire need of affordable housing. The enormous amount of construction within the District and the loss of small buildings owned by individual landlords, the cost of housing vis-a-vis income and income inequality have all stoked great interest in preserving and creating affordable housing programs. Additional supportive housing is also a critical need, as these developments enable a steady progression of homeless individuals and families from the streets, to shelters, and finally to permanent homes with the services they need to live healthful and independent lives. Without sufficient supportive housing, this population can become trapped in cycles of homelessness, mental illness, and/or antisocial behavior that devastates individual and collective quality of life.

The COVID-19 pandemic and related economic shutdowns and shifts in business and consumer behavior have also devastated small businesses, restaurants, bars, theaters, and other cultural institutions in CB5 more than any other part of the city. Travel restrictions, work-from-home policies, and health and safety regulations in the pandemic era have spurred mass business closures, economic losses, and high unemployment that threaten to irrevocably harm CB5. The announced theatre, cultural and performance space closures through much of 2021 and the ancillary loss of business and economic activity that these sectors generate for both local and citywide revenue is of particular consequence for CB5. Significant policy and legislative action - backed by substantial funding - is needed to support our neighborhood's businesses, employees, and institutions.

**Transportation and Mobility:** Our District has immense transportation needs given the dense concentration of businesses and the presence of Grand Central Terminal, Penn Station, the Port Authority Bus Terminal, and many subway stations within or just outside our borders. Commercial and office spaces make up roughly 65% of the district, bringing hundreds of thousands of commuters into the District and leading to severe congestion. Many stakeholders in CB5, along with advocates, have stated their wish for a comprehensive congestion plan to address congestion concerns. Accessible and safe public transportation is also extremely important given the large numbers of commuters, residents, and visitors in the district. MTA funding disputes between state and city officials continuously affect CB5, which is home to nine of the ten busiest subway stations (MTA Annual Ridership by Station Report). Furthermore, several highly frequented subway stations in CB5, such as the 4/5/6 at Union Square and S at Times Square, are not ADA compliant, limiting accessibility for residents and visitors alike.

In addition, our District has a high traffic flow with several complex intersections, which are in need of improved traffic safety as evidenced by high annual collision rates, poor pedestrian safety, and several conflicting traffic patterns. The District welcomes the newly created bike routes, but the safety of bikers, pedestrians, and drivers depends on active enforcement of regulations. Assigning the role of bike lane and traffic enforcement to agencies outside of the NYPD is supported by CB5. The disruption of normal commuting patterns caused by the pandemic has only increased the prevalence of biking citywide, and CB5 feels strongly that the City must capitalize on these changes in behavior to dramatically increase protected bike lanes and emphasize enforcement of safe driving, cycling, and pedestrian behavior as this transition away from cars continues.

**Parks, Cultural and other Community Facilities:** The participation of ordinary individuals in the processes that determine how we live in the city is vital, particularly in a time where increasingly such participation is being chipped away. CB5 fully supports the creation of the office of Public Realm and the appointment of a Director of the Public Realm. The Director of the Public Realm role is one which is desperately needed to take on the complexity to holistically manage the streets, sidewalks and plazas in a data driven manner. CB5 believes that this office will rectify the current lack of cohesion in city planning and allow stakeholders to have a voice on issues affecting the public sphere.

**Most pressing issue overall:**

The pandemic has wreaked devastating health and economic turmoil on the District. Thousands of small businesses are struggling or have ceased operations altogether. Theaters, cultural institutions, hotels and commercial businesses are either closed or are scaling down operations to reduce the spread of COVID. Restaurants and businesses that depend upon tourism and commercial visitors have been severely impacted. Economic development and support is necessary in order to begin recovery in the District and throughout the City. Every potential avenue to spur the return of workers, tourists and residents should be pursued. Rent relief, loans, grant forgiveness and other small business programs along with public/private collaborations will be crucial to re-establishing the arts, cultural institutions, restaurants, and businesses both large and small that are such an important part of CB5.

Since the pandemic, the District has seen an influx in its homeless population, particularly new street homeless, along with the addition of over 2,000 homeless individuals that have been removed from congregate shelters for their safety and placed in hotels within CB5. When tenant protections and moratoriums on residential and commercial evictions are lifted the expectation is that the District will see more of its residents facing eviction and homelessness. For this reason, homelessness is one of our top issues and needs to desperately be addressed through the provision of housing, supportive housing and supportive services.

Noise is the biggest complaint within our district and the number of complaints have only continued to rise. In addition, we are seeing increased quality of life complaints including harassment, and petty crime, all of which needs to be addressed in order to maintain the quality of life necessary for the recovery of the district.

**Health Care and Human Services:** CB5 has become host to over 2,000 homeless men and women who are currently housed in hotels within the district. Additionally, CB5 has seen a marked uptick in the number of street homeless within the district. To-date, there is no clear plan on how to address the needs of these individuals and we need high quality temporary shelters with wrap around services and programming now to serve the homeless. CB5 is seeking additional resources including the development of housing, supportive services, mental health services and addiction services.

With the removal of tenant protections and commercial and tenant moratoriums on evictions, there is an expectation that more people will lose their homes and need housing. Year upon year, CB5 has sought affordable housing within the district and elsewhere and it is needed now more than ever before.

**Youth Education and Child Welfare:** Due to COVID, some, if not all, curriculum will be delivered to students remotely. With many children within the district attending school on-line at least some of the time, it is imperative that the technology is in place to ensure that students have a seamless way to participate, communicate and be educated remotely.

Whether a student pursues synchronous or non-synchronous learning, curriculum should be developed to ensure that the students are engaged and able to easily access their work from home. Teachers need to be provided with the tools to teach effectively in this new remote / hybrid environment and students need to be provided with the laptops, iPads and Wi-Fi that enable them to connect to their classrooms and teachers.

**Public Safety and Emergency Services:** CB5 has seen an increase in noise complaints and other quality of life complaints such as unauthorized street vendors, petty crime, panhandling, loitering and street encampments, all of which detract from the quality of life in the District. Residents report that they do not feel safe in public spaces and, whether perception or reality, addressing these complaints will help to attract the residents and tourists back to the district. This should, in turn, spur the economic activity necessary for CB5's and the City's recovery.

And while CB5 needs enforcement of quality of life violations it does not believe that such enforcement lies solely with the NYPD. Instead, CB5 would like to see other agencies handle minor infractions. For example, DOT could handle traffic and bicycle violations and DOB could become responsible for noise violations. CB5 further hopes the City will explore other programs such as Cahoots, which would require mental health professionals, rather than the NYPD, to respond to complaints involving individuals with mental health issues.

**Core Infrastructure and City Services:** Year upon year, noise has consistently been the number one complaint within the district and so it remains for this year. CB5 would like to see the enforcement of noise complaints transitioned to a specific enforcement unit outside of the NYPD. CB5 also requests that any unit responding to complaints be provided with the necessary noise measuring equipment. Having this equipment at hand will allow any enforcement action to be addressed immediately and will help protect the quality of life of all residents and workers in the district.

**Housing Economic Development and Land Use:** More than any other community, CB5 relies upon its small businesses, commercial concerns, landmarks and cultural institutions for its vibrancy. Small businesses are an essential piece of the CB5 community and a powerful engine for its economic growth and employment. CB5 encourages every initiative — from commercial tenant rent solutions to public/private collaborations such as the NYC small business network — to help small businesses address the current challenges and navigate the way forward. It is only through the renewal and creation of small businesses that CB5 can begin the rebuilding which is critical to economic recovery of the district and the City.

Broadway Theatre brings over 100,000 jobs to the District and plays an especially important role here, as well as for all of NYC. All of the theatrical arts organizations within the District require assistance to bring back the tourists, theatre audiences and museum goers that help support all of New York City. These organizations need grants and funding to address their physical plants, but also supports for advertising and a plan to ensure that patrons feel safe when attending any art or theatrical events throughout the District.

**Transportation and Mobility:** The inadequacy of current traffic and parking enforcement is an extremely common issue attached to almost every street reconfiguration and transportation issue at CB5. We suggest a budget allocation to DOT to provide resources that would allow the city to return parking and traffic enforcement, including enforcement of activities that threaten pedestrians and cyclists, to DOT control instead of NYPD. This would address the NYPD's current non-responses to traffic and parking enforcement priorities as well as the widespread desire not to overburden the NYPD with routine issues that should be devolved to other departments. This was actually the state of affairs before the mid-90's and it has been publicly endorsed by traffic experts such as Sam Schwartz. Bicycle and pedestrian safety is paramount and any enforcement efforts should also be focused on Vision Zero policies and those activities that keep cyclists and pedestrians safe.

**Parks, Cultural and Other Community Facilities:** CB5 has seen the expansion of residential and commercial buildings which has heightened the awareness and need for public spaces and how these are managed. Unfortunately, there is no one Agency that has a handle on the overall planning of the City when taking into account issues such as shadows, access to green space, public toilets and other factors affecting public spaces.

The Director of the Public Realm role is one which is desperately needed to take on this complexity to holistically manage the streets, sidewalks and plazas in a data driven way. CB5 believes that this office will rectify the current lack of cohesion in city planning and allow stakeholders to have a direct way to voice their views. CB5 appreciates that this role will highlight the importance of light and air as a public commodity that should be considered as any other commodity when making decisions concerning the public realm.

#### **CB5 FY2022 Capital Requests**

1. Restore HPD Capital Budget reduction from FY2020 in FY2022 budget and allocate it to supportive housing loan program
2. Increase budget for HPD's Our Space Initiative which funds new construction rental units for the formerly homeless - The extra subsidy will help finance more new construction rental units at shelter rent allowance and create more units for the homeless (HPD)
3. Citileaf Mold Remediation/Supportive Housing Site (HPD)
4. Develop a medical respite program and longer term residential supports to address the needs of individuals with medical conditions released from hospitals and other institutions who cannot be accommodated within the shelter system. Medical respite programs provide hospitals with an alternative to discharging homeless patients to the streets or to unequipped shelters. Medical respite programs seek to improve transitional care for this population and end the cycle of homelessness by supporting patients in access benefits and housing (DOHMH)
5. New smartboards for up to 45 classrooms at the Clinton School at \$4,900 each (so up to \$220,500) (DOE)
6. Computers (800) for School of the Future (DOE)
7. 60 laptops for Ballet Tech's in-school instruction. The school was able to provide a laptop to every student who needed one for remote learning; however, this completely depleted their supply of in-school technology. Now, as we return to school year 2020-21, students still need the laptops for home instruction, but we have no laptops for in-person instruction. (DOE)
8. Wireless routers, webcams, and iPad keyboards to support hybrid learning at Baruch College Campus High School, as well as the provision of wireless services to their most at-risk students

9. Continuing support for additional park and outdoor amenities, specifically public restroom facilities. DPR should fund the renovation, construction and operation of public restrooms at parks throughout the district. The lack of these facilities is a major contributor to street pollution. (DPR)
10. \$1.8 M to replace the HVAC system at the Andrew Heiskell library (NYPL)
11. Creation of new substance abuse beds/ in-patient facilities to address needs of the District (DOHMH)
12. Creation of additional mental health clinic beds/in -patient facilities to address District need (DOHMH)
13. Provide upgrades to the Bellevue Intake Center physical plant (DHS)
14. Increase and improve security/lockers at Bellevue/congregate shelters (DHS)
15. City Lights Phase II Installations \$844,000 - 2008 streetscape beautification (DOT)
16. Flatiron Plaza Reconstruction (Total Project will be over \$40M when design completed – only ~\$10M currently allocated in City capital budget) (DOT)
17. New modular outdoor seating that would be placed on the 47/48 Plaza in Times Square as an amenity for visitors, as well as totem sign holders for wayfinding in the plazas. The seating costs \$25,000 and 4 totems total \$12,000 (DOT)
18. Establish pilot program of Green Loading zones (dedicates curb space for zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs) to pick up and drop off goods) (DOT)
19. Expansion of NYCCAS air pollution monitors throughout NYC at ground level (including at areas undergoing construction on capital projects) and increased intervals of testing (DEP)
20. Districtwide bike corral and bike storage installations (with the greater use of bikes in midtown south for commuting purposes and the big increase in bike theft, more secure parking locations are needed) (DOT)
21. Additional noise meters /sound meters that NYC DEP noise experts use when they take measurements in response to a noise complaint for use by non-NYPD responders (DEP)
22. Ensure repairs to make all CB5 schools fully ADA accessible (DOE)
23. Fund the 100,000 square foot public school on the Bleecker School site in Greenwich Village on land owned by New York University; utilize this opportunity before it passes back to NYU (DOE)
24. Installation of traffic cameras to address "block the box" violations (DOT)
25. Install Bus Priority Traffic Lights - on 5th Avenue (DOT)
26. Replacement of rooftop playground material at PS340. (DOE)
27. Upgrade of restroom at Delcorte Theatre in Central Park (DPR)
28. Identify, purchase and plant shadow resistant trees and plants in areas of Central Park covered by skyscraper shade (DPR)
29. Fund conversion and provision of HVAC for air filters for Broadway Theatres and Arts organizations. (SBS)

## **Expense Requests FY2022**

1. Funding for enhanced coordination on social services issues such as encampment clean-up, opioid addiction and mental health services (DHS/DSNY/DOMH)
2. Additional funding for ACT (Assertive Community Treatment) / HEAT teams (DOHMH)
3. Additional Case Managers for DHS: funding to provide case managers to homeless individuals and especially families (DHS)
4. Funding to streamline the “One Shot Deal” process. Emergency grant applicants may obtain rental assistance in case of impending evictions, assistance with home energy and utility bills, disaster assistance including moving expenses, and the purchase of personal items for health and safety. The City should build upon recent efforts to streamline this process to ensure more people are quickly connected to “One Shot Deal” (HRA)
5. Design & implement a capital campaign on 2 DSS/HRA key initiatives: anti-eviction legal resources for all New Yorkers and safe shelters for victims of domestic violence. City has meaningfully increased the funding for both service initiatives and continues to do so in the coming years. However, outreach and informational campaigns have not reached many corners of the city. If the services are not known, they will not be fully utilized (HRA)
6. Create a project-based rental subsidy for homeless set-aside units, separate from supportive housing (HPD)
7. Increased support for small business with loans, grants and other programs (SBS)
8. Fundraising, promotion and back end support (ala NYCGO) to generate NYC tourism (SBS)
9. Establish recreational and activity space on-site for homeless clients currently being housed in CB5 hotels (DHS)
10. Increase funding of full Summer Youth Employment program along with the creation of year-long youth employment programs to increase opportunity and combat violence (DYCD)
11. Restoration and enhancement of summer youth camp seats for underserved communities and working families (DYCD)
12. Funding of a mental health professional in every middle and high school (DOE)
13. Funding of staff (Executive Director, coordinator and administrator) for new Office of the Public Realm (Office of the Mayor)
14. Transfer of budget funds to return parking and traffic enforcement to DOT control instead of NYPD (as had been done in the 1990s) (DOT)
15. Reinstate full litter basket and curbside garbage collection. Litter baskets have been overflowing leading to the trash left on curbs and an increase in vermin (DSNY)
16. Provide or expand NYC organics collection programs. Establish and operate at least three organics drop-off sites in each community district. The Department of Sanitation temporarily suspended the curbside organics composting service on May 4th, 2020. An organics drop-off site would allow residents to dispose of organic waste in an environmentally friendly manner and its a major priority for it to be resumed in 2022 (DSNY)
17. Funding for procurement and maintenance of DSNY Clean Curb pilot program and containers on curbs (DSNY)
18. Restoration and expansion of discount MetroCards for low-income New Yorkers through the Fair Fares Program (DOT)

19. Allocation of DOT Street Improvement Project (SIP) funds for temporary Broadway Vision block reconfigurations and resurfacings (W 25th Street to West 31st Street) and Madison Avenue Open/Play Street between E 23 and E 26 (DOT)
20. Traffic Analysis and Streetscape Design Plan for 6th Avenue (23rd Street to Herald Square) (DOT)
21. Study identifying unnecessary vehicles and areas to eliminate/reduce use of department & city-owned SUVs to decrease emissions (DOT)
22. Fund a pilot for sensor and camera-based enforcement of double parking, illegal parking/driving in the bike and bus lanes and “block the box” solutions within CB5 (DOT)
23. Remove all non-working phone booths as well as those sited next to LINKS kiosks (DOITT)
24. Funding for the promotion and support of a reinvigoration of the Broadway Theatre industry (DCLA)
25. Funding for additional sanitation baskets throughout CB5 (DSNY)

After much discussion the above report passed with a vote of 47 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstaining: **IN FAVOR:** Achelis, Athanail, Bahor, Beitchman, Brosnahan, Burton, Cafaro, Chou, Clark, Dale, Dowson, Ford, Frewer, Garcia, Goldman, Goshow, Haas, Harris Jr., Heyer, Isaacs, Johnson, Kaback, Kalafarski, Kang, Kinsella, Law-Gisiko, Levy, Lucic, Maffia, McCall, Meyerson, Miller., Pawson, Rabar, Shapiro, Slutzkin, Smith, Spandorf, Spence, Stern, Sung, Tschinkel, Verdi, Webb, Weintraub, Whalen, Yang. **ABSTAIN:** Barbero.

**At this point in the meeting Chair Barbero introduced the following speaker:**

**Gale Brewer, Borough President:** She announced that they are writing a letter to the Board of Elections on a great job handling the long lines. She spoke of a hearing coming up on December 9 about the campaign finance board. She said they were cosponsoring a virtual Tenants Resource Fair on November 23. She noted that January 21 is coming around very quickly and unless the governor extends the moratorium, there will be lots of discussion about how to deal with tenant issues. She also mentioned that there is a lot of helicopter noise complaints. She stated that she was very focused on uptown Manhattan where the percentage of covid is rising. She spoke briefly on the upcoming budget and also working with principals and superintendents to address the remote learning needs of children. She spoke of the proposed public realm director role and complimented the board about leading this advocacy. She spoke about the gentrification problem and how it is resulting in no slots for early childhood education and after school programs. She also noted that housing is a number one priority, and they are looking for hotels that could be used for quality, affordable housing.

There being no further business, the regularly scheduled meeting of Community Board Five adjourned at 7:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

Craig Slutzkin  
Secretary

Julie Chou  
Assistant Secretary